

Summary of Provenance Issues:

The following summary has been prepared to restate the findings of the Report for the purpose of directing further studies of the building. The following stages in the history of the building known as the Brougham Central Hotel, at Pickering Museum Village have been documented with certainty using photographs first person verification, and records. Since these stages are not in doubt they are simply recorded as a reference for further work.

1. In 1980, the building was moved to museum site Greenwood from the museum site in Brougham where it had been relocated from the north side of junction of Brock Road and Highway 7.
2. The building was known previously as;
Woodwards General Store circa 1950
E. R. Woodward General Store circa 1939
Mechin & Poucher General Store circa 1910
3. There is also strong support for the earlier history of the building as;
Brougham Central Hotel circa 1857
Brougham Sons of Temperance Hotel circa 1854

Before the 1854 date, however, the history of the building has been much less clear. This Report has sought to establish previous uses and names for the building prior to 1854, since the building research, timber dating, paint analysis and wallpaper type all strongly support construction before 1835. It is also apparent that the building was in fact two separate buildings before 1854. For the purpose of this Report these previous stages have been identified as;

4. Bentley General Store circa 1845
5. Abraham Losie Store circa 1826
6. Peter Matthews house circa 1822

One account suggests that William Bentley ran the General Store on the north side of Concession Six (highway 7) just west of Brock Road as early as 1835. Contradictory information suggests that this was not the case before 1838. The date for plastering the interior of the west wing and weathering on the clapboard on the south side of the west wing where it was later covered by the addition of the south wing suggests that amalgamation of the two parts of the building did not occur before 1842. Since the early establishment of the Bentley Store has no support other than oral history, and the west wing of the building is designed for a purpose such as a store, there is a strong probability that the west wing was at least part of the Bentley Store, and that it represented an earlier phase of construction and storekeeping than has been preserved in the oral record. The ? of those who settled after 1838 and whose who settled before may also be seen at odds, due to the large percentage of local settlers who were involved in the Rebellion of 1837. Due to the troubling contradictions and omissions of the oral record and apparent omissions of the Whitby Land Registry, this Report has relied on a spectrum of inquiries into the building fabric, history of change in the building and used these facts to analyze the veracity of the other sources. While this process is not complete, nor perfect, it represents a far more realistic method of synthesizing information about the history of the building than relying heavily on oral history of the area, particularly where divisions pertaining to the political polarization of 1837 exist even today. This would suggest that some time before 1842, possibly in 1842 the Matthews and Losie families had left and the two structures were then combined.

Item	Description and Reasons	Degree of Certainty
1	B.C.H. composed of two buildings. (west wing and south wing)	100%
2	West wing was constructed as a timer frame, hewn and pegged in manner consistent with 1820s to 1850s	High
3	South wing was constructed as a separate vertical plank frame house with hewn sills & top plate, log joists at ground floor.	High
4	Undisturbed joist in west wing floor, circa 1826 +/- 2 years.	High
5	Timber blocking at north wall of west wing, circa 1842 +/- 3 years.	High
6	Tie beam for second chimney	
7	Roof repairs at West wing (front another source) circa 1818	Moderate
8	Rafter at South wing with bark attached, circa 1822 +/- 2 years	High
9	Hotel/Store located on Lot 19 Concession 6 before 1900	100%
10	West wing moved to location of store from one of Lots 7 - 10	Strong
11	South wing moved to location of store from L19 C6 or L19 C5.	Moderate
12	South wing installed as addition to West wing after both finished	100%
13	South wing without lathe and plaster before connection to W.w.	Very high
14	First lathe on South wing, hand split accordion lathe.	Very high
15	First chimney in West wing unknown construction. Second chimney constructed with masonry on reinforced tie beams	Very high
16	Second chimney constructed after 1838 with masonry (brick) from attic ceiling to room only.	Very high
17	Third and fourth chimneys in West wing constructed after 1852.	High
18	Windows, doors and trim at first floor of south wing circa 1850.	Very high
19	Sawn lumber in vertical planks cut during earliest settlement period when control of plank thickness was primitive.	High
20	Top plate and sills in both west wing and south wing expertly hewn with broad axe. Scribed lines to mark mortises consistent in layout and profile. Two inch deep mortises cut cleanly by skilled carpenter at both buildings.	High
21	Wrought nails found in oldest, remote areas of both buildings. Nails laminated and brittle, typical of pre-1850 hand forged iron.	Moderate
22	Original windows and door of South wing survive on 2 nd floor.	High
23	Accordion lathe from South wing installed on strapping applied to former exterior of West wing after buildings combined. Accordion lathe and method of nailing typical pre-1840s.	High

24	Best room of West wing purpose built as a commercial room for store or possibly as a meeting room. Centre ceiling joists planed.	Very high
25	Peter Matthews parents held patents on Lot 19 Concession 6 and Lot 18 Concession 6 prior to 1820.	Very high
26	Thomas Matthews, Peter's father died in 1819.	High
27	Peter Matthews, as eldest son, inherited part or most of original 650 A in 1819.	High
28	Whitby Land Registry entries fro Lots 19 & 18 Concession 6 and Lots 19 & 18 Concession 5 written by a single hand from top of ledger page starting 1799 to bottom of page (varies from 1865 to 1869). Handwriting unchanged from top to bottom, indicating that this was either written no earlier than the last entry on the page, or that the Ledger was rewritten after 1869.	Very high
29	Names of other leading men of the Reform movement (later accused Rebels,) mentioned in Whitby Chronicle, Jan. 1834 do not appear in Registry for these lands. Even Thomas Matthew is not mentioned after original Patent. Only Mary, his wife, and by her maiden name. These men, had they been present, would be recorded unless Ledger entries are in error.	Very high
30	?	
31	Census of 1820 lists 37 adult males in Pickering Township.	High
32	Very few settlers before 1830 were not landowners.	High
33	Original patents would apply to almost everyone of these 37 men.	High
34	Assignment of property locations as per original patens may be used to eliminate most if not all of the other landowners listed in the 1820 census from ownership of Lots 19 Concession 6 & 5.	Moderate
35	Abraham Losie married Peter's sister Jane. He purchased 60 acres from the Matthews family on south half of Lot 19 C. 6 in 1822	High
36	Abraham Losie was a storekeeper in Whitby in 1817 or 1818	Moderate
37	References to the first general store existing on a 1/4 acre lot west of Brock Road (north side) place the building on a parcel of Lot 19 C 6. The only 1/4 acre lots which fit the description (in 1857 survey) are lots #7,8,9 & 10. General Store existed on one of these lots before 1840.	High
38	Lot 8 is low and subject to flooding by cree. Lots 9 & 10 are only a couple of feet higher and may be flooded periodically. Only Lot 7 is above expected flooding, but also close enough to creek to be attractive as a watering place for teams.	Moderate
39	Lot 7 most likely original location for West wing.	Moderate
40	A building foundation on Lot 7 belongs to later structure which burned within the last 25 years.	Very high
41	Property where Brougham Temperance Hotel is recorded after 1854 was still shown attached to remaining farmlands of Lot 19 C 6 in 1857 survey.	Very high

42	Sixty acres (Losie purchase) from south half of L19 C 6 may not have included lands along Highway 7 as far as Old Brock Road, but may have included all lands along the south-west property line of south half of L19 C6 (remaining 100 A registered to Mary Ratan (Rattan) in 1822.	Moderate
43	Remaining parcel of 40 A matches closely, lands along west side of Old Brock Road from Hwy. 7 north past Matthews lane.	High
44	South wing constructed in same year as purchase.	High
45	South wing constructed either for Peter Matthews family, or Abraham Losie family. The former is more likely since the 1826 structure was clearly more than a residence from the beginning, and there is a greater possibility that Losie would have been involved in construction of the store as a business due to his previous store keeping experience. It would be less likely therefore, that he would construct another new building only four years later, having spent his capital purchasing the 60 A farm from Matthews, when he married Jane Matthews.	High
46	South wing was not constructed on the 60 A sold to Losie	Moderate
47	West wing was constructed on the 60 A purchase	High
48	Thomas Matthews (Jr.) Was born in 1822 and lived first 16 years of his life in his father's house, a vertical plank frame building which Thomas reproduced in Michigan on his own farm, now a listed Heritage site circa 1852.	High
49	Thomas Matthews documents indicate that he left his father's house in 1838, the year that his father was hanged.	High
50	Historic records used by Leo A. Johnson indicate that the families of many Rebels and even those seen as sympathizing with the Rebels, were persecuted after 1837, and often forced to sell their lands and buildings at substantially reduced prices to newcomers.	High
51 (49)	No solid evidence exists for William Bentley owning a general store west of Brock Road before the Rebellion.	High
52 (50)	General Store known later as Bentley Store probably owned and run by Abraham Losie before 1838.	High
53 (51)	This same general store is the West wing.	Moderate/High
54 (52)	The Brougham Central (Temperance) Hotel is composed of the original General Store located west of Brock Road and the Peter Matthews House.	Moderate
55 (53)	The probability that the General Store and Peter Matthews House can be confirmed with further building investigations, site archeology, and archival research.	High

Further Research goals: An outline of Recommendations

The following areas of research are strongly recommended to continue the work of this Report: While some of this work cannot be done until restoration work is started on the buildings, some work is prerequisite. It is recommended that this work be continued in 2001 with a view to starting the Restoration Program in the second half of 2001 or first half of 2002. It is not recommended that the building should continue to be used in the current manner after the spring of 2002 due to the structural deterioration of the south wing and the impending loss of Archaeological information in Brougham.

A. Archaeology

Location of the original sites of the south and west wings is extremely urgent since the Hamlet of Brougham is likely to undergo irreversible development in the next several years as the Hwy. 407 extension is completed. The work is important to verify the location and provenance of the original structures, as well as locate artifacts which would be expected to support the understanding of all three buildings. It is recommended therefore, that this work be conducted simultaneously with further building archaeology, since the two disciplines overlap.

1. Locate the original building sites for both wings of building before move to crossroads.
2. Focus on Lots 7-10 on north side of Brock Road (1 acre total) for 1826 wing.
3. Survey original Matthews lands east of old Brock Road particularly along laneway and creek at east side of Lot 5 Concession 6, and along west side of field bordering on Old Brock Road Secondly, review the 30 acre parcel between old Brock Road and the Brock Road which contains approximately 25 houses and building lots.
4. Review any material documentation of the building site before the move to the museum.
5. Review any previous archaeological work in the area.

B. Building Archaeology

1. Create access to crawl spaces under both wings, to review and sample original joists and sills
2. Expose and examine vertical plank framing at four corners, and examine top plates and sills. Expose and examine method of pinning from exterior. Record method of scribing and fitting tenons in top plates and sills.
3. Examine walls for tool marks, graffiti and other evidence of occupation prior to installation of lathe and plaster around 1842. Record and compare with similar marks and traces in the west wing.
4. Examine and record interior paint sequences at second floor and rear of second floor in west wing. Compare with sequences for south wing (interior) and all of exterior for both wings. Compare earliest sequences with other buildings of known ages. Prepare commentary of early surface preparation and indicate whether building interior was unfinished for an extended period of time prior to first finishes.
5. Conduct further testing of timber samples to determine dates for specific repairs to roof and floors, and check partitions at south wing for probable date of installation
6. Provide detail drawings of hardware changes on various doors.
7. Compare early machine made trim with similar mouldings on other buildings.
8. Analyze the pattern of lathe and plaster repairs throughout the building using remote sensing where possible. (Infrared scanning is best used in cold weather). Record areas of later change.
9. Examine and record wallpaper samples and fabric backing. Compare with known wallpaper types and manufacturers.
10. Sample and analyze mortar in building and in traces found in attic for comparison with soil samples.
11. Examine pollen taken from insect tunnels in the original joists of the west to determine prevalent species and proportions of pollen found in the tunnels, during the time that the joists were exposed to the open air. Analyze to determine season and decade of construction.
12. Examine and record all glass and windows found in the structure. Interview staff and review documents recording buildings at time of move in 1980 to determine extent of replacements.

C. Archival Research

1. Review Government Archives in the U.K. for references to the Rebellion, Charles Matthew and others in Pickering Township in particular.
2. Review National Archives in Ottawa
3. Review diaries and Archives in Toronto
4. Review land registry records for all of Pickering Township before 1826 to determine locations of original Patents.
5. Comparison of other land registry records for the early settlement period.

D. Genealogical Research

1. Interviews and reviews with descendants of the Matthews family, and others
2. Search of Genealogical Archives
3. Establishment of a Web site and use of advertisements requesting information pertaining to the early settlement of Pickering Township which may remain in private collections in Canada, and the United States. The use of a Web Site would allow researchers in other countries such as Britain and Australia to contact the museum village directly. The Web site may also be used to promote the museum village to the larger community of southern Ontario.

E. Documentary Research

1. Review of publications relating to Vertical Plank Frame and Conventional Timber Frame buildings in early Ontario and Quebec.
2. Review of publications regarding naval and marine carpentry in the British and American Navies at the time of the Revolution, as it relates to Peter's father.
3. Research the early stores and Inns of Upper Canada.
4. Research the early roads linking York and Kingston and review statistics.
5. Review materials relating to patterns of early land settlement in Upper Canada
6. Further research of Land Registries in other Municipalities. Irregularities in early records have been noted elsewhere in the Province by other researchers, and may contribute supporting materials to this project.

F. Collections

1. Conservation of artifacts which can be attributed to the era and persons associated with the building should be included, if such artifacts can be located. It is not known at this time, whether any artifacts may be directly attributed to the building for any of the three dates studied.
2. Interpretation of the building, particularly as the General Store circa 1826- 1835 and the Matthews' House circa 1822 will require research of artifacts and other studies. It is recommended that funds for this work be allocated for staff researchers to travel and locate relevant materials since they will also have to establish a program of interpretation.
3. Furniture appropriate for the era, including fittings and cabinetry for the General Store used the Matthews House should also be researched, with a catalogue of sources for original or replica pieces. It is again recommended that funds should be allocated to trained staff for this work. Due to the capricious nature of auctions and artifact availability, it may also be advisable to establish a fund for the purchase of furniture and artifacts for future display in the restored buildings so that these pieces can be pursued over the several years that it will take to complete the project.
4. Money should also be allocated to restoring pieces already in the museum collection, which will be appropriate for display in the restored buildings.

Recommendations for further Research following this Report have not been approved by Committee. Budget costs have not been provided in this Report.